# Local-Level Tobacco Compliance Monitoring and Observations at the Retail Point of Sale: Providence

### **Executive Summary**

#### June 14, 2018

In 2017, Rhode Island (RI) was one of four states to receive a two-year competitive grant award from the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC) to evaluate strong tobacco point of sale (POS) policies at the local level. The City of Providence Healthy Communities Office is one of six grantees funded by the Rhode Island Department of Health (RIDOH) Tobacco Control Program (TCP) to monitor compliance and strengthen enforcement structures specific to local POS policies. The City of Providence has local-level policies that require a local tobacco retail license, such that funds from licensing and fines support enforcement and policies to limit the sale of flavored and discounted products. Together, these policy components are referred to as the Rhode Island Model Tobacco Policy. Providence is the first city in the United States0 to pass a ban on price discounting, including coupon redemption and multi-pack discounts. The city serves as a best practice model for youth smoking prevention.

#### **City of Providence Point of Sale Tobacco Policy**

- Requires a local-level tobacco retail license with fines and fees dedicated to enforcement
- Limits the sale of flavored tobacco products
- Limits the sale of discounted tobacco products and redemption of coupons
- Provides structures for enforcement

This report is the second of four local-level retail reports that will be generated every six months to monitor changes in the retail environment over two years. The RI-STARS (*Standardized Tobacco Assessment for Retail Settings*) observational tool describes the local retail tobacco environment. RIDOH Tobacco Retail Compliance Forms measure compliance with existing policies. RI-STARS and RIDOH Tobacco Retail Compliance Form data are collected every six months from a census of retailers. This report used the State of Rhode Island Division of Taxation Department of Revenue list of tobacco retailers for the city of Woonsocket.<sup>1</sup> U.S. Food and Drug Administration (FDA) data were downloaded directly from FDA's website for April 2017 to April 2018.<sup>2</sup> FDA compliance check data were "crosswalked" with RI-STARS and RIDOH compliance checks to better understand the evolving tobacco landscape in Providence.

#### Key Findings are on page 2 of this report. All tables can be found at the end of this report.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> State of Rhode Island Division of Taxation Department of Revenue. Cigarette Dealer Licenses. http://www.tax.ri.gov/help/CigaretteLicList.php. Updated 1/11/18

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> US Food and Drug Administration. Compliance Check Inspections of Tobacco Product Retailers https://www.accessdata.fda.gov/scripts/oce/inspections/oce\_insp\_searching.cfm

## Key findings

#### **RI-STARS**

- 73% of stores sampled for RI-STARS were observed to have flavored tobacco products available for sale.
- 46% of stores sampled for RI-STARS were observed to have discounted tobacco products available for sale.
- A notable difference between the first and second round of STARS was the decrease in the percent of stores observed to be selling clearly labeled flavored cigarillos, large premium cigars, chew and e-liquids. In Round 1, for example, 33% of sampled stores were observed to have flavored cigarillos but only 6% of sampled stores in Round 2 were observed to have these flavored products for sale.

## **RIDOH Retail Compliance Checks**

- A total of 11 violations were recorded in the first round of enforcement checks and 29 violations were recorded in the second round of enforcement checks. Youth buy inspections showed a <u>drop in the sales</u> of tobacco products to minors from seven violations recorded for sales of cigarillos to youth in Round 1 to one violation of a sale of a cigarillo to youth in Round 2 (Table 2).
- Adult flavor buy inspections showed a <u>21% increase</u> in flavored tobacco product sales from Round 1 (one violation recorded) to Round 2 with 21 violations recorded (Table 3).
- Adult coupon inspections showed a <u>two-fold increase</u> in violations from three violations recorded in Round 1 to seven violations recorded in Round 2 (Table 4).
- The increase in adult flavor buy and coupon inspections reflects, in part, two changes in the compliance check sampling frame.
  - The sample in round 2 included all stores from the first round of STARS store observations where flavored tobacco products and coupon redemptions were observed.
  - The second round of compliance check included 200 stores; double that of round 1 with 100 stores.

### **Store-Level Federal and Local Tobacco Policy Violations**

- From April 2017 to April 2018, there were 54 stores that had at least one FDA or RIDOH compliance violation.
- No store cited for an RIDOH compliance check violation in the 1st round of compliance checks had an RIDOH compliance check violation in the 2nd round of compliance checks.
- Two stores cited for an RIDOH compliance check violation in the 1st round of compliance checks also had an FDA violation issued between April 2017 and April 2018.
- Nine stores cited for an RIDOH compliance check violation in the 2nd round of compliance check had a recorded FDA violation in the past year.

### Recommendations

 Data from both the first and second round of store observations and compliance checks suggest that there are opportunities for enhanced enforcement, especially for sales of flavored products (including not-clearly-labeled flavored products) and price discounting at the point of sale (coupon redemption).

### **RI-STARS**

The national *Standardized Tobacco Assessment for Retail Settings* (STARS) is a user-friendly retail observation tool designed to increase state and local capacity to conduct observations of the availability, placement, promotion and price of tobacco products in the retail tobacco environment to inform policy change.<sup>3,4</sup> Items were selected for their policy relevance and data are collected by community partners and/or youth. Data from STARS are observational only. STARS is not a compliance or enforcement check tool. In 2017, RIDOH Tobacco Control Program (TCP) redesigned STARS and created RI-STARS to be more relevant to the Rhode Island Model Tobacco Policy and its restrictions on flavored tobacco products and discounted tobacco products. Non-essential items were deleted. The definition of flavored products was changed to exempt mint, menthol, and wintergreen; and three new items were added. Items were specific to price discounts ("*Any Coupon Cigarette Price Promotions?*" and "*Any Buy-One-Get-One Cigarette Promotions?*") and not-clearly-labeled flavored products ("*Game Blue sold here?*").

In March 2018, the Providence Healthy Communities Office staff visited 100 randomly-selected retailers to collect the second round of RI-STARS data. Store observations were completed in 87 of 100 stores, 82 of which were found to sell tobacco products. Most sampled stores were convenience stores (58%). Other stores included 14 liquor stores (17%), 9 grocery stores (11%), 7 bars/ restaurants (9%), 2 pharmacies (2%), and 2 tobacco shops (2%).

### **RIDOH Retail Compliance Checks**

RIDOH Compliance Check Forms were redesigned in 2017 to improve data collection systems and better monitor compliance with the Rhode Island Tobacco Model Policy. Refined user-friendly forms were created to help enforcement personnel capture data on: 1) youth sales violations, 2) flavor sale violations, and 3) coupon redemption violations

In February and March 2018, Providence enforcement officers conducted RIDOH compliance checks in 187 tobacco retail stores (Tables 2 - 4). The sample in Round 2 included all stores that were issued a violation of Providence's tobacco policies in Round 1 (n = 11), all stores where flavored products were observed in the 1<sup>st</sup> round of STARS (n = 67), and 122 stores randomly selected from the Department of Revenue Tobacco License retailer list. Undercover adult officers conducted buy inspections for clearly labeled or not-clearly-labeled flavored products in 124 stores. Eleven stores in this sample were randomly selected for undercover adult detective buy inspections for coupon redemption. Fifty-two stores were undercover youth buy inspections.

Most stores visited in the first and second round of youth compliance checks were convenience stores or grocery stores (90% in Round 1; 87% in Round 2). All youth attempted to purchase cigarillos. *Garcia y Vega* was the most common brand attempted to purchase (Table 2).

About half of the stores visited in the first and second round of flavor compliance checks were convenience stores (51% in Round 1; 48% in Round 2). Cigarillos were the most common flavored product that undercover detectives attempted to purchase in the first round of compliance checks.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Henriksen L et al. Standardized Tobacco Assessment for Retail Settings (STARS): dissemination and implementation research. Tobacco Control. 2016; 25 (Suppl 1):i67-i74

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Combs T et al. Assessing Retail Environments with STARS Standardized Tobacco Assessment for Retail Settings. Center for Public Health Systems Science at the Brown School at Washington University in St. Louis. July 2015.

Most tobacco products purchased in the second round of compliance checks were not specified (Table 3).

Sixty percent of stores visited in Round 1 for coupon compliance checks were convenience stores. A mix of store types were included for RIDOH Coupon Redemption Compliance Checks in Round 2. All detectives attempted to redeem a price discount coupon for cigarettes. Discounts ranged from \$0.50 to \$1.15 per pack (Table 4)

### **FDA Compliance Check Inspections**

The FDA conducts annual random undercover youth buy inspections of tobacco retailers to determine a retailer's compliance with federal laws and regulations. Results from FDA compliance check inspection are publicly available in a searchable database with mapping functionality.<sup>2</sup> The database lists which inspected retailers received a warning letter, a civil money penalty, a no-tobacco-sale order, or were found to have no observable violations. Repeat violations elevate the violation from a warning letter to a civil money penalty, thus civil money penalties indicate a retailer's second (or higher) violation of the year. From April 1, 2017 to April 1, 2018, three stores were found to have FDA violations.

Please note that the number of inspections that a state completed varies based on a variety of factors and violation data cannot be readily compared across states, or compared with violation data collected under other initiatives, such as Synar.

## **Store-Level Federal and Local Tobacco Policy Violations**

A crosswalk analysis was conducted to display RI-STARS observations and all available FDA and RIDOH violation data at the store-level. This allows the reader to see what stores in Providence had a violation during the reporting period, and what type of violation. Table 5 includes all stores in Providence with at least one flavored or discounted product observed during RI-STARS, or an FDA violation, or an RIDOH compliance check violation.

Eleven stores observed to have flavored tobacco products in the first round of STARS were issued violations for sale of flavored tobacco products to adults in the second round of compliance checks. Two of the six stores issued violations for redeeming discount coupons on a pack of cigarettes in the second round of compliance checks were observed to have redemption of cigarette coupons in the first round of STARS.

#### **Recommendations**

Providence has had restrictions on the sale of flavored products and discounts for five years. Enforcement of these policies is complex and can be challenging. This is the first time that Rhode Island tobacco compliance monitoring and observational reports have been crosswalked and displayed in one place at the store-level. Observational data from RI-STARS suggest that flavored products are widely available for sale in Providence, including Game Blue, a not-clearly-labeled flavor product. Additionally, tobacco coupons affixed to packs of certain brands of cigarettes were observed in 44% of stores in the 1<sup>st</sup> round of STARS (n= 40 stores) and 45% of stores in the 2<sup>nd</sup> round of STARS (n = 37 stores).

The FDA recorded 34 youth buy violations in Providence. Eight stores cited for a recent FDA violation for sale of tobacco products to youth also had an RIDOH compliance check violation for sale of flavored tobacco products to adults (Round 2). One store that received an FDA violation for selling tobacco to a minor also had an RIDOH compliance check violation in Round 2 for selling cigarettes with a coupon price redemption. Only one store had a compliance check violation in Round 2 for selling a flavored tobacco product to a minor but had no recent FDA violations.

Coupon violations combined with the unexpectedly high prevalence of discounted products observed through RI-STARS provides preliminary data that coupon redemption can be effectively enforced. Tobacco companies spend more money on price discounts at POS than on any other form of tobacco promotion.<sup>5</sup> Research indicates that policies restricting the redemption of coupons that reduce the price of cigarettes below the statutory minimum price, combined with other POS policies, can significantly reduce youth uptake of conventional cigarettes.<sup>5</sup> A compelling body of evidence suggests that when tobacco products are inconvenient, difficult and expensive for youth to obtain the number of adolescents who try tobacco products and who continue to smoke goes down.<sup>6</sup>

This brief provides an initial picture of how retail establishments in the city of Providence are complying with local POS policies. Flavored product violations, however, may be underestimated by these data. Tobacco products available in fruit, candy and alcohol flavors that are popular with youth may not be labeled as a flavored. Still, data from both the 1<sup>st</sup> and 2<sup>nd</sup> round of store observations and compliance checks suggest that there are opportunities for enhanced enforcement, especially for sales of flavored products (including not-clearly-labeled flavored products) and redemption of tobacco coupons. The Providence Healthy Communities Office has completed 75 retailer education visits and will continue to conduct retailer education in the next two rounds of STARS and compliance checks. Findings from this brief underscore the need for continuing retail education with a strong focus on enforcement of the Rhode Island Model Policy.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Tobacco Control Legal Consortium. Policy Approaches to Restricting Tobacco Product Coupons and Retail Value-Added Promotions. Last Updated: October 2013.

http://www.publichealthlawcenter.org/sites/default/files/resources/tclc-guide-policy-approaches-pricing-cppw-2013.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Friend KB et al. The impact of local U.S. tobacco policies on youth tobacco use: A critical review. Open J Prev Med. 2011; 1(2): 34–43.

	Roun	d 1	Round 2			
	Decembe	er 2017	March 2			
	Yes (n=90)	%	Yes (n=82)	%		
Any tobacco sold here	90	100%	82	100%		
Tobacco Ads Outside Store	52	58%	53	65%		
Pharmacy Counter Present	7	8%	2	2%		
Alcohol Available	14	16%	21	26%		
Tobacco within 12" of Youth Products	14	16%	27	33%		
Tobacco Ads 3 feet from Floor	79	88%	62	76%		
Cigarettes						
Available	89	99%	80	98%		
Menthol Available	88	98%	80	98%		
Buy One Get One (BOGO)	13	14%	5	6%		
Coupons	40	44%	37	45%		
Cigarillos						
Available	89	99%	81	99%		
Flavored Available	30	33%	5	6%		
Singles Available	2	2%	2	2%		
Available for less than \$1	43	48%	23	28%		
Self Service Available	2	2%	0	0%		
Game Blue Available	68	76%	60	73%		
Premium Large Cigars						
Available	70	78%	51	62%		
Flavored Available	21	23%	2	2%		
Self Service Available	3	3%	0	0%		
Chew		0%		0%		
Available	15	17%	14	17%		
Flavored Available	8	9%	1	1%		
E-Cigarettes						
Available	36	40%	26	32%		
Flavored	2	2%	1	1%		
Self Service Available	2	2%	1	1%		
E-liquids						
Available	30	33%	15	18%		
Flavored Available	19	21%	12	15%		
Self Service Available	3	3%	1	1%		

Table 1. Providence STARS Observed Availability

<sup>1</sup> Of the count of stores shown above, some stores are in more than one category.

Compliance Check Fields	Round 1 % (n)	Round 2 % (n)
	November 2017	March 2018
	Yes % (n = 50)	Yes % (n = 52)
Store type		
Convenience Store	42% (21)	65% (34)
Supermarket/ Grocery/ Department Store	48% (24)	21% (11)
Beer & Wine Store	10% (5)	9% (5)
Specialty (Bar, Vape, Hookah, Smoke Shop)		4% (2)
Products attempted to purchase		
E-Cigarettes		
Labeled as Flavored		
Not Labeled as Flavored		
E-Liquids		
Labeled as Flavored		
Not Labeled as Flavored		
N/A		
Cigarillos	100% (50)	100% (52)
Labeled as Flavored		
Not Labeled as Flavored		100% (52)
N/A	100% (50)	
Product labeled as flavored		
Yes		
No		100% (52)
N/A	100% (50)	
Youth sale made		
Yes	14% (7)	2% (1)
No		
If sale to youth: age		
Under 18 years	14% (7)	2% (1)
18- 21 years		
Violations		
Cigarillos	14% (7)	2% (1)

# Table 2. Providence RIDOH Youth Compliance Checks

N/A = information not available/not known.

	Round 1	Round 2
	November 2017	March 2018
	% (n = 45)	% (n =124)
Store Type	, ,	· · · · ·
Convenience Store	51% (23)	48% (59)
Supermarket/ Grocery/ Department Store	20% (9)	26% (32)
Beer & Wine Store	28% (13)	19% (23)
Drug Store/ Pharmacy		6% (7)
Specialty (Bar/Vape/Hookah/		
Smoke Shops)	4% (2)	2% (3)
Products attempted to purchase		
E-Cigarettes		2% (3)
E-Liquids		2% (2)
Cigarillos	95% (43)	13% (16)
N/A		83% (103)
Products listed above not available	5% (2)	
Product brands		
Garcia y Vega	93% (42)	8% (11)
Newport	6% (3)	2% (2)
Dutch Masters		<1% (1)
Whitehorse		<1% (1)
White Owl		<1% (1)
Vaporin		<1% (1)
Swisher Sweets		<1% (1)
Optimo		<1% (1)
Cuttwood		<1% (1)
Buck Naked Exotic		<1% (1)
Blu		<1% (1)
N/A		83% (103)
Product Labeled as Flavored		0070 (100)
Yes	5% (2)	14% (21)
If Flavored, Flavor:	<u> </u>	1470 (21)
Grape		3% (4)
Mango		3% (4)
Cognac		2% (3)
Honey		2% (3)
Cherry		2% (3)
Java Fusion		2% (2)
Fireball		
Mega Melons		<u>&lt;1% (1)</u> <1% (1)
Vanilla		<1% (1) <1% (1)
N/A	50/ (2)	<1/0(1)
	5% (2)	
Sale made	20/ (4)	140/ (04)
Sale:	2% (1)	14% (21)
Violations	00/ /4)	4.40/ (04)
Violations: N/A = information not available/not known	2% (1)	14% (21)

### Table 3. Providence RIDOH Flavor Compliance Checks

N/A = information not available/not known.

	Round 1	Round 2
	November 2017	March 2018
	% (n = 5)	% (n = 5)
Store Type	, /	/
Convenience Store	60% (3)	40% (4)
Supermarket/ Grocery/		
Department Store	20% (1)	30% (3)
Drug Store/ Pharmacy		30% (3)
Local License Displayed		
Yes	40% (2)	100% (10)
No	40% (2)	
N/A	20% (1)	
Products attempted to		
purchase		
E-Cigarettes		
E-Liquids		
Cigarillos		
Conventional cigarettes:	100% (5)	100% (10)
Product brands		
Newport	60% (3)	50% (5)
Marlboro	40% (2)	50% (5)
Product labeled as flavored		
Yes		
No		0% (0)
N/A		
If not labeled as flavored		
Menthol	60% (3)	10% (1)
Platinum	20% (1)	20% (2)
Red Label	20% (1)	10% (1)
Midnight		10% (1)
Edge		10% (1)
N/A		40% (4)
Sale made		\
Yes	60% (3)	70% (7)
No		, /
N/A		
Value coupon redeemed		
Price Discount	100% (5)	70% (7)
Buy-One-Get-One		
Price discount of coupon		
Range	\$.50 - \$1.00	\$.50 - \$1.15
Violations	φιού φτιού	¥.00 ¥1.10
Yes	60% (3)	70% (7)
N/A	40% (2)	30% (3)

Table 4. Providence RIDOH Discount Compliance Checks

N/A = information not available/not known.

## Table 5. Providence Crosswalk

				STARS o	bserved av	ailability			Enford	cement Vio	lations	FDA Violations Issued
		Rou	ind 1	Rou	nd 2		Round 1			Round 2		
Retailer Name	Address	Flavored Products	Coupons	Flavored Products	Coupons	Flavored Products (Youth)	Flavored Products (Adult)	Coupons	Flavored Products (Youth)	Flavored Products (Adult)	Coupons	April 2017- April 2018
7 Eleven	775 Cranston Street	x	х									Warning Letter not yet available
7 Eleven	270 Broad Street	х	Х	х	х		х					
7 Eleven	548 Atwells Avenue	х	Х	х	х			х				
7 Eleven	460 Smith Street			х	х							
71 Milk Store	71 Hope Street											Warning Letter: Marlboro cigarettes
A to Z Liquors	319-325 Douglas Avenue			x	x					х		Warning Letter Issued: Newport Box 100s
A&B Convenience & Deli Inc	1245 Chalkstone Ave			x								
Academy Farms	524 Academy Avenue	x	х	x	х							
Acme Liquors	1023 Chalkstone Avenue	x								x		Warning Letter Issued: Newport Box 100s
Admiral Discount Liquors	395 Admiral Street			x								

				STARS o	bserved av	ailability		Enford	cement Vio	lations	FDA Violations Issued
		Rou	ind 1	Rou	nd 2		Round 1		Round 2		
Retailer Name	Address	Flavored Products	Coupons	Flavored Products	Coupons	Flavored Products (Youth)	Flavored Products (Adult)	Flavored Products (Youth)	Flavored Products (Adult)	Coupons	April 2017- April 2018
Alia Market	384 Elmwood Avenue	х									
Americas Market	501 Hartford Road	Х	Х			Х					
Anthony's Drug Stores	219 Manton Ave			х	Х						
Arm Market	29 Academy Avenue			х					Х		
Baez Market	454 Public Street			x	x						Civil Money Penalty: Product Unavailable
Baron Market LLC	77 Union Avenue			х							
Bomar Liquors	927 Eddy Street	Х									
Broadway Express Mart	306 Broadway	Х	Х								
Broadway Market & Deli	665 North Broadway										Warning Letter Issued: Newport Box 100s
Brookfield Liquors	470 North Broadway										Warning Letter: Garcia y Vega Game Blue cigars
Carlito Market	35 Candace Street										Warning Letter: Marlboro cigarettes
Central Liquors	930 Broad Street	Х									-

				STARS o	bserved av	ailability			Enford	cement Vio	lations	FDA Violations Issued
		Rou	ind 1	Rou	nd 2		Round 1			Round 2		
Retailer Name	Address	Flavored Products	Coupons	Flavored Products	Coupons	Flavored Products (Youth)	Flavored Products (Adult)	Coupons	Flavored Products (Youth)	Flavored Products (Adult)	Coupons	April 2017- April 2018
Chalkstone Dairyland	1002 Chalkstone Avenue	х	х							x		Warning Letter Issued: Newport Box 100s
Charlie's Variety	1308 Eddy Street	Х	Х	х	Х							
Cibao Meat Supermarket	228 Manton Ave									х		
College Convenience Mart	664 Admiral Street	х	х									
Colombia Auto Service Corp	1160 Westminster Street			х						х		
Cranston Family Market	560 Cranston Street			х								
Cranston Meat Market	624 Cranston Street	х		х								
Crespo Market	1115 Broad Street			Х								
Cumberland Farms	1297 Broad Street	х	х								x	Warning Letter: blu Magnificent Menthol ENDS
Cumberland Farms	751 Hope Street		Х									
Cumberland Farms	200 Union Avenue	Х	Х		Х	х						
Cumberland Farms	774 Branch Avenue				х							

				STARS o	bserved av	ailability		Enford	cement Vio	lations	FDA Violations Issued
		Rou	ind 1	Rou	nd 2		Round 1		Round 2		
Retailer Name	Address	Flavored Products	Coupons	Flavored Products	Coupons	Flavored Products (Youth)		Flavored Products (Youth)	Flavored Products (Adult)	Coupons	April 2017- April 2018
Eagle Supermarket	117 Ives Street	х	Х	х							
East Side Mart	422 Lloyd Ave			х	Х						
Economy Mobil	389 Elmwood Ave									х	
El Bambazo Market	981 Broad Street	x									Civil Money Penalty: Product Unavailable
El Encanto Market Inc	508 Plainfield Street			х	x						
El Fogonazo Meat Market	1059 Broad Street	x									Civil Money Penalty: Garcia y Vega Game Leaf Natural cigars
Elmwood Deluxe Mart	610A Elmwood Avenue		Х								
Exxon	69 Taunton Avenue										Warning Letter not yet available
Fabian Liquors	500 Cranston Street			х							
Family Dollar	921 Manton Avenue	x									Civil Money Penalty: Marlboro cigarettes

				STARS o	bserved av	ailability			Enford	cement Vio	lations	FDA Violations Issued
		Rou	ind 1	Rou	nd 2		Round 1			Round 2		
Retailer Name	Address	Flavored Products	Coupons	Flavored Products	Coupons	Flavored Products (Youth)	Flavored Products (Adult)	Coupons	Flavored Products (Youth)	Flavored Products (Adult)	Coupons	April 2017- April 2018
Family Dollar	150 Pocasset Avenue		х									
Family Dollar	1515 Broad Street					Х						
Family Dollar	1525 Smith Street			х	Х							
Family Dollar	322 Valley Street		Х									
Family Dollar	541 Smith Street			х	Х							
Family Dollar	678 Branch Avenue	Х	Х							Х		
Family Dollar	1030 Chalkstone Avenue	х	х					х				
Federal Hill Wine & Spirits	125 Atwells Avenue	x	Х									
Fernandez Liquors	332 Elmwood Avenue			х	х			х				
Fernandez Square Liquors	342 Broad Street	х										
Finest Car Wash	36 Pleasant Valley Parkway											Civil Money Penalty: Marlboro cigarettes
Foodland Farms	638 Charles Street			х	Х							
Frenchy Mart	718 Broad Street									х		

				STARS o	bserved av	ailability			Enfor	cement Vio	lations	FDA Violations Issued
		Rou	ind 1	Rou	nd 2		Round 1			Round 2		
Retailer Name	Address	Flavored Products	Coupons	Flavored Products	Coupons	Flavored Products (Youth)	Flavored Products (Adult)	Coupons	Flavored Products (Youth)	Flavored Products (Adult)	Coupons	April 2017- April 2018
Gemmas Market	458 Cranston Street	х		х								
Grassos Gulf	35 Plainfield Street	Х	Х									
Gulf Express	255 Reservoir Ave			х	х					х		
Hartford Mart	469 Hartford Ave									Х		
International Meat	676 Cranston Street	х										
Irving	280 Plainfield Street	х	х			x						Civil Money Penalty: Product Unavailable
Julian Market	100 Julian Street	Х										
Kelly's Car Wash	200 Charles Street	Х										
Kevin Food Mart	103 Academy Avenue	х										
Khan Associates	286 Valley Street	Х								Х		
Khout	691 Valley Street	Х	Х									
La Esquina Market	274 Webster Avenue					Х						
La Fortuna Market	692 Prarie Ace			Х	Х							

				STARS o	bserved av	ailability		Enford	cement Vio	lations	FDA Violations Issued
		Rou	ind 1	Rou	nd 2		Round 1		Round 2		
Retailer Name	Address	Flavored Products	Coupons	Flavored Products	Coupons	Flavored Products (Youth)	Flavored Products (Adult)	Flavored Products (Youth)	Flavored Products (Adult)	Coupons	April 2017- April 2018
La Ideal Meat Market	227 Waldo Street								Х		
La Mundial Market	208 Cranston Street			x							
Lava Smoke Shop	170 Atwells Avenue	Х		Х							
Los Compadres Market	93 Laura Street			х							
Los Mina Market	100 Harold Street	x									Warning Letter Issued: Newport Box 100s
Los Sananita Market	105 Reservoir Avenue	x		x	x						Civil Money Penalty: Marlboro cigarettes
Manton Food Mart	315 Manton Ave			х							
Manton Gas	342 Manton Ave	x	х	x	x						Civil Money Penalty: Marlboro cigarettes
Manton Liquors	307-309 Manton Ave			х							-
Manton Liquors	344 Manton Avenue	х									
Mega Liquors	961 Manton Avenue	х									

				STARS o	bserved av	ailability			Enford	cement Vio	lations	FDA Violations Issued
		Rou	ind 1	Rou	nd 2		Round 1			Round 2		
Retailer Name	Address	Flavored Products	Coupons	Flavored Products	Coupons	Flavored Products (Youth)	Flavored Products (Adult)	Coupons	Flavored Products (Youth)	Flavored Products (Adult)	Coupons	April 2017- April 2018
Milano's Pizza	659 Smith Street	x	х									Civil Money Penalty: Product Unavailable
Mobil	389 Elmwood Avenue											Civil Money Penalty: Product Unavailable
Mobil Mart	296 Valley Street			х	Х					х		
Mobil Mart	1055 Smith Avenue	x		x								Civil Money Penalty: Garcia y Vega Game Green cigars
MYK City Mart	322 Broad Street	Х										
Neighborhood Mini Mart	150 Elmwood Avenue	x	х							Х		
New Metro Mart	221 Thayer Street			х								
New Way Liquors	598 Elmwood Avenue	x	х									
Nour Market	316 Smith Street	x								х		Civil Money Penalty: Newport Box cigarettes
Nunez Fruit Market	1437 Broad Street	х										

				STARS o	bserved av	Enford	cement Vio	FDA Violations Issued				
		Round 1		Round 2		Round 1			Round 2			
Retailer Name	Address	Flavored Products	Coupons	Flavored Products	Coupons	Flavored Products (Youth)	Flavored Products (Adult)		Flavored Products (Youth)	Flavored Products (Adult)	Coupons	April 2017- April 2018
O G Mart	130 Washington Street	х										
One Energy	168 River Avenue											Civil Money Penalty: Newport Box cigarettes
Oriental Plaza Inc	373 Smith Street			х	Х							
PC Mart & Gas	408 Douglas Ave			Х								
Pine Food Market	465 Pine Street	Х				Х						
Plainfield Meat Market	600 Plainfield Street	х										
Pocasset Meat Market	50 Pocasset Avenue	Х										
Providence Deli and Grill	103 Elmwood Avenue			x	х					х		
Providence Market	757 Broad Street				Х							
Quality Meat Market	583 Broad Street			х	Х							
Quisqueya Liquors Inc	1266 Broad Street			х								
R&R Market	649 Admiral Street	Х										
Regency Market Place	3 Regency Plaza	Х										
Reyes Liquors	1187 Westminster Street	х	Х									

				STARS o	bserved av	ailability		Enfor	FDA Violations Issued			
Retailer Name		Rou	Round 1		Round 2		Round 1			Round 2		
	Address	Flavored Products	Coupons	Flavored Products	Coupons	Flavored Products (Youth)		Coupons	Flavored Products (Youth)		Coupons	April 2017- April 2018
Rite Aid	200 Academy Avenue	х	х	х	х							
Rite Aid	456 Branch Ave										Х	
Rite Aid	711 Broad Street	Х	Х								Х	
Rocky's Market	19 Messer Street								х			
S& K Food Mart	1801 Atwells Ave			Х	Х							
Salina Market	103 Hawkins Street	х	х									
Sam's Food Store	28 Hartford Avenue			x	x							Warning Letter Issued: blu Magnificent Menthol ENDS
Sam's Food Stores	391 Douglas Ave			х							х	
Sam's Tobacco & Convenience	776 Douglas Avenue			х	х							
Sanchez Liquors	425 Manton Ave			Х	Х							
Sanchez Market	676 Broad Street	Х	Х									
Savers Mart	871 Elmwood Ave			x	x					x		Civil Money Penalty: Product Unavailable

			STARS observed availability						Enford	FDA Violations Issued		
		Round 1		Round 2		Round 1			Round 2			
Retailer Name	Address	Flavored Products	Coupons	Flavored Products	Coupons	Flavored Products (Youth)	Flavored Products (Adult)	Coupons	Flavored Products (Youth)		Coupons	April 2017- April 2018
Seasons Corner Market	457 Benefit Street			x	х							
Shell	598 Branch Avenue	х										
Sherlyn Mini Market	294 Pocasset Avenue	х										
Shop & Go Food Market	216 Union Ave			х	Х							
Smith Hill Liquors	461 Smith Street				Х							
Sohia's Market	524 Smith Street											Warning Letter Issued: Newport Box 100s
Sono Retailers	981 Manton Ave			х	Х					х		
Speedway	442 Manton Avenue											Civil Money Penalty: Product Unavailable
Speedway	83 Point Street	Х										
Standard Liquor Store	829 Eddy Street			х	Х							
Star Market	334 Broad Street			х								
Station One Convenience Store	524 Manton Avenue	х	х									Civil Money Penalty: Product Unavailable

			STARS observed availability							Enforcement Violations				
		Round 1		Round 2		Round 1			Round 2					
Retailer Name	Address	Flavored Products	Coupons	Flavored Products	Coupons	Flavored Products (Youth)	Flavored Products (Adult)	Coupons	Flavored Products (Youth)	Flavored Products (Adult)	Coupons	April 2017- April 2018		
Stop Market & Associates	308 Cranston Street			х										
Summit Liquors	452 Hartford Ave	Х			Х									
Sunoco	481 Warren Avenue											No-Tobacco- Sale Order		
Sunoco	597 Branch Avenue	Х	Х									Warning Letter Issued: VUSE Solo e-liquid		
Sunrise Market	1222 Smith Street	Х	Х	Х	Х									
Super Star Mini Mart	163 Broadway	х	х			х						Civil Money Penalty: Newport Box cigarettes		
Tenares Supermarket Inc	484 Cranston Street			х										
Tom's Food Mart	1348 Chalkstone Ave			х						х		Civil Money Penalty: Newport Box cigarettes		
Tropical Liquors	310 Cranston Street	Х												
V&J	272 Public Street	Х												
VF Liquors	306 Charles Street	Х								Х				

				STARS o	bserved av	Enford	cement Vio	FDA Violations Issued				
		Round 1		Round 2		Round 1			Round 2			
Retailer Name	Address	Flavored Products	Coupons	Flavored Products	Coupons	Flavored Products (Youth)			Flavored Products (Youth)	Flavored Products (Adult)		April 2017- April 2018
Vivo Meat Market	370 Plainfield Street	x	х									
Voula Enterprises LLC	201 Smith Street			x	х							
Walgreens	1140 North Main Street	x									x	Warning Letter: Marlboro cigarettes
Walgreens	1 Pocasset Avenue	Х	Х							Х		
Walgreens	295 Academy Avenue	х	х									
Walgreens	333 Atwells Avenue	Х	Х								Х	
Walgreens	533 Elmwood Avenue			х	х							
Wal-Mart	51 Silver Spring Street	х	х									

#### **Rhode Island Tobacco Control Grant Team**

Erin Boles Welsh, MSW Geri A. Guardino, MPA Jasmine Arnold Deborah N. Pearlman, PhD

For more information, please contact Project Manager, Geri Guardino (Policy Analyst, Tobacco Control Program) at (401) 222-3044 or <u>geri.guardino@health.ri.gov</u>

**Acknowledgments:** The Tobacco Control Program gratefully acknowledges Ellen Cynar and Azade Perin of the Providence Healthy Communities Office, Providence Police Sergeant David Tejada, and Elsa Larson, former Epidemiologist/Evaluator for the Rhode Island Tobacco Control Core Grant Team.